

## Shi'a *Rijali* Views of Muhammad ibn Muslim ibn Shihab al-Zuhri

Farahnaz Vahidnia

*Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, International Campus, Mashhad, Iran (corresponding author)*

[farahnaz-vahidnia@yahoo.com](mailto:farahnaz-vahidnia@yahoo.com)

Hasan Naqizadhi

*Faculty of Theology, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran*

Gholamrida Raisian

*Faculty of Theology, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran*

**ABSTRACT:** Ibn Shihab al-Zuhri (d. 124 AH/741-2 CE) is a renowned *hadith* scholar in the Sunni tradition. His name appears in the chains of narration of over 2,200 *hadith*, including numerous *hadith* in Shi'a sources. Nonetheless, despite his presence in Shi'a books, Shi'a scholars have historically disagreed about whether or not to accept al-Zuhri as a reliable narrator on account of his connections with the Umayyad ruling powers. In this paper, the views of Shi'a biographers on al-Zuhri will be examined as well as the *hadith* attributed to him to offer a conclusive view on whether or not he should be accepted as a reliable narrator within the Shi'a tradition.

**KEYWORDS:** al-Zuhri; Ibn Shihab; Shi'ism; *hadith*; *rijal*; Umayyads.

### *Introduction*

Although Ibn Shihab al-Zuhri is mentioned in the chains of narration of tens of Shi'a *hadith*,<sup>2</sup> and over 2,200 *hadith* in general,<sup>3</sup> Shi'a scholars disagree about his reliability, primarily because of his strong affiliations with the Umayyad ruling dynasty.<sup>4</sup> Therefore, this paper will attempt to determine his reliability as a *hadith* narrator according to the criteria of Shi'a scholarship. It will compare the views for and against him (*jarh* and *ta'dil*) given by Shi'a biographical (*rijali*) scholars. Because Shaykh Tusi expresses considerable animosity towards him, and refers to him as an enemy (*'aduw*), it will specifically examine how Tusi treats al-Zuhri's narrations in his two influential *hadith* compilations, *Tahdhib al-Ahkam* and *al-Istibsar*.<sup>5</sup> This investigation will aid in the validation of *hadith* narrated from him, and the conclusions derived can be used in future research on other *hadith* narrators who are found in both Shi'a and Sunni books.

### *A short biography of al-Zuhri*

Muhammad ibn Shihab al-Zuhri was referred to as 'al-Madani' and 'al-Qurayshi'<sup>6</sup> - meaning a member of the tribe of Quraysh from Medina. In fact, he is said to have been born in Mecca<sup>7</sup> in either 50 AH/614 ce<sup>8</sup> or 58 AH/622 ce,<sup>9</sup> but to have studied at length in Medina,<sup>10</sup> hence the appellation 'al-Madani'; sources give his *kunyah* (tekonym) as Abu Bakr.<sup>11</sup> His father was Muslim ibn 'Ubayd Allah ibn Muslim ibn Shihab,<sup>12</sup> and his mother was named 'A'ishah.<sup>13</sup> He is said to have been acquainted with Imam al-Sajjad (A) and Imam Muhammad al-Baqir.<sup>14,15</sup> Part of the second generation of Medinah's muhaddiths,<sup>16</sup> he witnessed the transition from oral to written transmission of *hadith* which occurred during the reign of 'Umar ibn 'Abd al-Aziz; regarding this, it is related that he said, 'We had an aversion to recording knowledge until these *amirs* forced us to do it; then we were of the opinion that we should not withhold them [the written collections of *hadith*] from any of the Muslims.'<sup>17</sup> His career with the Umayyads began in 81 or 82 ah when he joined the court of 'Abd al-Malik ibn Marwan and was appointed as a judge by Yazid ibn 'Abd al-Malik (r. 101-105 AH/720-724 ce). Additionally, Hisham ibn 'Abd al-Malik (r. 105-125 AH/724-743 ce) chose him as his son's teacher. Frequently, al-Zuhri travelled from Syria to Mecca and Medina to perform the hajj; he also used to teach in Medina. He spent the last years of his life in the Hijaz.<sup>18</sup>

Al-Zuhri is unarguably one of the most influential early *hadith* scholars, and his influence on Islamic historiography and even theology cannot be doubted.<sup>19</sup> Material related from him is preserved in the *sihah* works, the *masanid*, and the works of *sirah* (Prophetic biography), and includes not only religious rulings and narrations but also historical information about the pre-Islamic era, the life of the Prophet, and the events after the time of the Prophet up until the caliphate of Mu'awiyah. He is particularly known for his book on *maghazi* as well as accounts of the life of the Prophet.<sup>20,21</sup> Additionally, he wrote treatises on the Qur'an such as *Tanzil al-Qur'an bi-Makkah wa Madinah* (The Revelation of the Qur'an in Mecca and Medina) and *al-Nasikh wa al-Mansukhfi al-Qur'an* (The Abrogating and the Abrogated in the Qur'an).<sup>22</sup> He had a number of famous teachers and students.<sup>23</sup> As with other renowned Islamic scholars, there are a number of stories - which may or may not be apocryphal - about his intellectual prowess. For instance, it is said that he memorized the entire Qur'an in eighty nights and memorized each *hadith* upon hearing.<sup>24</sup> It is also said that, one day, his wife became so fed up with his dedication to his scholarship that she told him, 'By God, your books cause more trouble than three co-wives.'<sup>25</sup> He passed away on 17 Ramadan 124 AH/741-2 ce in Syria.<sup>26</sup>

#### *Views of Shi'a biographical (rijali) scholars*

Al-Zuhri is one of those figures whom Shi'a biographers, both early and modern, strongly diverge on, even with regards to whether he should be considered Sunni or Shi'a. Shaykh Tusi,<sup>27</sup> 'Allamah al-Hilli,<sup>28</sup> Tafrishi,<sup>29</sup> Ha'iri Mazandarani,<sup>30</sup> and Ibn Dawud<sup>31</sup> refer to him as an enemy of the Ahl al-Bayt ('*aduw*). Similarly, Muhammad Baqir al-Majlisi says that al-Zuhri's *hadith* are weak (*da'if* because al-Zuhri is an enemy of Ahl al-Bayt; additionally, he identifies him as a Sunni.<sup>32</sup> Another famous Shi'a *rijali* scholar, al-Najashi, does not mention al-Zuhri at all in his *rijal* work. Since al-Najashi dedicated his work to narrators found in Shi'a *hadith* as well as those who wrote books about the Shi'a, the implication is that al-Najashi simply considered him a Sunni who was not of relevance to Shi'a *hadith*.<sup>33</sup>

In contrast, Bihbahani<sup>34</sup> and Mirza Husayn Nuri<sup>35</sup> consider al-Zuhri to have been Shi'a on the grounds that al-Zuhri relates *hadith* from Imam al-Sajjad confirming the imamate of the twelve Imams.<sup>36</sup> Mirza Husayn Nuri also mentions some *nudbah* (lamentations) narrated from Imam al-Sajjad by al-Zuhri.<sup>37</sup> Khansari's view is that al-Zuhri was initially an enemy of Ahl al-Bayt; however, later in life, al-Zuhri became Shi'a through the guidance of Imam al-Sajjad.<sup>38</sup> Al-Khu'i identifies al-Zuhri as someone who narrated from Imam al-Sajjad (A) and Imam al-Baqir (A) and writes that 'although Ibn Shihab al-Zuhri is a Sunni scholar, from the story of how he [accidentally] killed someone and received guidance from Imam al-Sajjad (A),<sup>39</sup> it is obvious that he loved Imam al-Sajjad (A) and honoured him.'<sup>40</sup> (This account will be discussed in a later section of this paper.) Similarly, Tustari quotes Tusi as saying that al-Zuhri was an enemy of Ahl al-Bayt, but then continues, 'If Shaykh [Tusi] calls him a Sunni, this is correct; but calling him an enemy of Ahl al-Bayt is incorrect, because reports of his love for Imam al-Sajjad (A) are widespread.'<sup>41</sup> Along the same lines, when discussing *Man La Yahduruhu al-Faqih* (one of the primary books of Shi'a *hadith*), Muhammad Taqi Majlisi maintains that al-Zuhri was actually Shi'a and therefore al-Zuhri's *hadith* are *sahih*.<sup>42</sup>

Most likely, al-Zuhri was considered to be an enemy of Ahl al-Bayt due to his close ties with the Umayyad caliphate. Those who accuse him of forging *hadith* cite a letter to al-Zuhri attributed to Imam al-Sajjad, as well as remarks attributed to Ya'qubi and Ibn Abi al-Hadid. Therefore, these items will be discussed next.

#### *The letter attributed to Imam al-Sajjad*

Some sources mention a letter from Imam al-Sajjad to al-Zuhri in which the Imam criticizes al-Zuhri for cooperating with the Umayyad caliphate. However, the oldest source that mentions it is *Tuhaf al-Uqul* by Abu Muhammad Harrani (d. 381 ah), and a chain of narration for it is not given. Furthermore, the content of the letter itself suggests that it was not actually written by Imam al-Sajjad to al-Zuhri, since the expressions in the letter indicate that the addressee was an elderly person. This point is discussed at length by Tuchayi who observes that the letter says:

You have been overburdened with the graces of God who has given you good physical health and a long age.

[...] You are not living in a permanent abode; you are in a temporary house that you will leave soon. How does a man stay after the departure of his peers?

[...] Supply yourself [with the necessary provisions]; the long journey is approaching you.<sup>43</sup>

[...] You neglected to mention your old men and friends who passed away while you remained after them like a hornless sheep.

[...] If this world makes you in such a manner, while you are attaining such an old age, enjoying such deep-rooted knowledge and being so near to death, then how could a young person be saved while he is ignorant, fatuous in his views, and immature in his thought?<sup>44</sup>

Since the letter is said to have been written at a time when al-Zuhri was still middle-aged, it can be concluded that the expressions used in the letter would not be appropriate for him; and, therefore, it is unlikely that the letter was really addressed to him.<sup>45</sup>

Additionally, portions of the letter indicate that the addressee was a prominent intellectual figure in the Muslim community at the time. The letter says:

He put forward His argument against you when He charged you with the responsibility of His Book, made you understand His religion, [and] introduced you to the traditions of His Prophet Muhammad (S).

[...] The only difference between you and them is that you occupy a distinctive standing in people's minds such that they have been pursuing your opinions and carrying out your orders. They deem lawful anything you deem lawful and deem lawful anything you deem unlawful. You are not fit enough for that.

[...] You have exposed them to misfortunes and tempted them by precluding them from their earnings because of what they have seen from you. Hence, they longed to attain the level of knowledge that you have obtained or obtaining through it what you have obtained. Therefore, they have drowned in a bottomless ocean and an immeasurable misfortune. May God give succour to you and us. He is the One whose help is sought.<sup>46</sup>

While al-Zuhri did in fact become a prominent religious scholar, he did not enjoy this position until later in life. Additionally, he did study under even more prominent figures in his time, and himself asserted that he became a *faqih* only after gaining knowledge from them.<sup>47</sup> Moreover, 'Abd al-Malik himself recommended that al-Zuhri gain knowledge, so it is unlikely that he, at the time, was the figure mentioned in the letter.<sup>48</sup>

Furthermore, many statements in praise of Imam al-Sajjad (A) are attributed to al-Zuhri. Some of the statements attributed to al-Zuhri are:

I have never met among the Ahl al-Bayt a person more meritorious than 'Ali ibn al-Husayn.<sup>49</sup>

Sufyan ibn 'Uyaynah relates, 'I asked al-Zuhri, "Have you met 'Ali ibn al-Husayn?" "Yes", he replied, "I have met him. I have never met a person more meritorious than him. By Allah, I have never known him to have a friend in secret or an enemy in public." I asked him, "Why is that?" He answered, "Because all those who loved him envied him because of their abundant knowledge of his outstanding merits, and all those who hated him took care of him because he took great care of them."<sup>50</sup>

According to al-Zuhri, after 'Ali ibn al-Husayn's departure, a sign of hard work which had affected his back skin and made it dry and hard was found. Later it was found that he had carried water for his weak and old neighbours during night all the time.<sup>51</sup>

Further *hadith* of a similar nature have been mentioned in other sources.

Furthermore, in addition to praising al-Sajjad (A), al-Zuhri also used to relate *hadith* from him on various subjects (which will be discussed in the latter section of this paper). All of this suggests a close relationship between al-Zuhri and the Imam (A).<sup>52</sup> Therefore, it seems unlikely that Imam al-Sajjad (A) would have sent him such a letter.<sup>53</sup>

Lastly, it should be observed that after the event of 'Ashura, Imam al-Sajjad (A) followed a policy of *taqiyyah*, and pursued more subtle methods of influencing the community. This letter does not seem to be in concordance with that policy.

#### *Al-Zuhri according to Ya'qubi and Ibn Abi al-Hadid*

The Shi'a historian al-Ya'qubi (d. 897/8 ce) relates that the caliph 'Abd al-Malik repaired Masjid al-Aqsa in Jerusalem to encourage Muslims to visit it instead of the Ka'bah, and asked al-Zuhri to fabricate a tradition to that effect. Therefore, it is said that al-Zuhri fabricated a *hadith* from the Prophet saying, 'It is not worth travelling except to [visit] the three mosques: Masjid al-Haram, Masjid al-Aqsa, and my mosque.'<sup>54</sup>

However, there are some problems with the attribution of this narration to him. First, al-Fasawi (d. 277 ah),<sup>55</sup> al-Hamadhani (known as Ibn al-Faqih, d. 365 ah),<sup>56</sup> Khargushi (d. 406 ah),<sup>57</sup> al-Hamawi (d. 626 ah),<sup>58</sup> al-Jazari (d. 630 ah),<sup>59</sup> al-Maqrizi (d. 845 ah),<sup>60</sup> Ibn Kathir (d. 774 ah)<sup>61</sup> and Salihi (d. 942 ah)<sup>62</sup> all give other sources for this narration - that is, that it came from someone other than al-Zuhri. Secondly, the text itself is inconsistent.<sup>63</sup> Third, since al-Zuhri was born in 50 or 58 ah, it would have been impossible for him to narrate directly from the Prophet. Fourth, the enmity between 'Abd Allah ibn Zubayr and 'Abd al-Malik transpired between 65 and 73 ah,<sup>64</sup> and, at this time, al-Zuhri would only have been in his early twenties; at that age, he was not yet famous, and so there would have been no reason to ask him to fabricate a *hadith*. Finally, it does not make sense to argue that 'Abd al-Malik was trying to keep people away from the hajj, particularly since the *tabi'un* had a strong presence there.<sup>65</sup>

Additionally, Ibn Abi al-Hadid relates in *Sharh Nahj al-Balaghah* that Muhammad ibn Shaybah said:

One day, Ibn Shihab al-Zuhri and 'Urwah ibn al-Zubayr were cursing 'Ali (A) in the mosque of Medina. News of this reached Imam al-Sajjad (A), who came to them and said, 'O 'Urwah, my father and yours - let God judge between them. God ruled in favour of my father, but - O Zuhri - if you were in Mecca, I would have revealed your rank.'<sup>66</sup>

However, this story conflicts with another account wherein al-Walid ibn 'Abd al-Malik thought that Qur'an 24:11 - 'The one among the group who was the chief instigator will face a great torment', referring to the scandal about 'A'ishah - had been revealed to place blame on 'Ali ibn Abi Talib (A). Upon hearing this, al-Zuhri told him, 'This is not true. 'Urwah said that 'A'ishah said that this verse was revealed to place blame on 'Abd Allah ibn Abi Sulul, the head of the hypocrites in Medina.'<sup>67</sup> This shows that al-Zuhri was not in such a weak position vis-a-vis the caliphate that he could not speak up, nor was he being blindly manipulated by the anti-'Alid rhetoric. In another account, Ibn Athir al-Jazari writes:

After al-Zuhri related the *hadith* of Ghadir, 'Ubayd Allah said, 'I said to Ibn Shihab al-Zuhri, do not narrate this [*hadith*] in Syria, or your ears will be filled with insults against 'Ali (A).'

He replied, 'I swear to God, my knowledge of 'Ali's merits is so vast that if I reveal this knowledge, I would be killed.'<sup>68</sup>

Other *ahadith* attributed to al-Zuhri which are in favour of Imam 'Ali and, in fact, also reflect a pro-Shi'a stance include:

Al-Zuhri narrates from Asma' al-Ansari that on the night of Imam 'Ali's martyrdom, whenever any stone in Iliya' [Jerusalem] was lifted at random, blood was found to be flowing under it.'<sup>69</sup>

Zuhri quotes from Salim that his father said, 'The Messenger of God told me that on the Day of Resurrection, whoever has more love for the family of Muhammad (S) will have more light.'<sup>70</sup>



Al-Zuhri narrates from 'Urwah that 'A'ishah said, 'I saw my father staring copiously at 'Ali's face. I said to my father, "I see you are looking a lot at the face of 'Ali?" He replied, "O my daughter, I heard the Messenger of Allah (S) say, 'Looking at the face of 'Ali (A) is worship (*'ibadah*).'"<sup>71</sup>

A number of similar *ahadith* have been mentioned in other sources as well.

Additionally, as mentioned above, it has been suggested that, by the end of his life, Ibn Shihab al-Zuhri was a Shi'a. For instance, a *hadith* is related from him regarding fasting while travelling or ill in which he gives the opinion of Ahl al-Bayt (A) - namely, that a person who is travelling or ill may not fast<sup>72</sup> - although this was not the mainstream opinion among Sunnis.<sup>73</sup> Additionally, he narrates that Imam Baqir (A) said: 'God almighty made a covenant with the Prophets regarding the Imamate of 'Ali (A) and made a covenant with them that they would preach the imamate of 'Ali ibn Abi Talib (A).'<sup>74</sup> Lastly, it is related from al-Zuhri that for the first seven years of Islam, the Prophet and 'Ali ibn Abi Talib used to worship together. He also mentions that when Qur'an 15:94 ('expound openly what you are commanded') and Qur'an 13:7 ('And the Unbelievers say: "Why is not a sign sent down to him from his Lord?" But thou art truly a warner, and to every people a guide') were revealed, 'Ali ibn Abi Talib was the only member of Bani Hashim to openly accept it; from that day onward, the Messenger of God announced that 'Ali was his 'brother' and 'minister'.<sup>75</sup>

### *Shi'a citations of al-Zuhri*

In addition to *hadith* from al-Zuhri in praise of Imam 'Ali (A), Imam al-Sajjad (A), Imam al-Husayn (A),<sup>76</sup> and Fatimah al-Zahra (A),<sup>77</sup> there are also *hadith* from al-Zuhri related from Imam al-Sajjad on a variety of subjects, including the types of fasting,<sup>78</sup> rules relating to fasting,<sup>79</sup> Imam Sajjad and the Holy Qur'an,<sup>80</sup> the best deeds in the view of Allah,<sup>81</sup> condemning covetousness<sup>82</sup> and prejudice,<sup>83</sup> the virtues of reciting the Qur'an,<sup>84</sup> inviting people to Islam,<sup>85</sup> the reward of fever,<sup>86</sup> how to treat prisoners of war,<sup>87</sup> and the most difficult time for the son of Adam.<sup>88</sup> Jurists and scholars of *hadith* have referred to these *hadith*.

As mentioned previously, Shaykh Tusi adamantly rejected al-Zuhri as a reliable *hadith* transmitter. Nevertheless, he includes *hadith* transmitted through al-Zuhri in his compilations, and even gives these *hadith* due consideration in situations when two *hadith* apparently conflict. For instance, Tusi argues that two *hadith* about fasting during 'Eid and certain days of the hajj - one of which is narrated by al-Zuhri from Imam al-Sajjad - do not actually conflict and can both be accepted.<sup>89</sup> Shaykh Tusi also cites a *hadith* from al-Zuhri saying that al-Sajjad (A) said that Allah ordered the people to fast *onyawm al-shakk* (the thirtieth day of the month of Sha'ban) for its own sake and not as part of the fasting of the month of Ramadan.<sup>90</sup> This *hadith* is corroborated by a similar narration in *al-Kafi*, via a different chain of narration, wherein Imam al-Sadiq advises his companions to fast *yawm al-shakk* rather than inadvertently miss a day of fasting of the month of Ramadan.<sup>91</sup> Many of the narrations quoted from Ibn Shihab are *mutabi* (corroborated with the same wording) and *shahid* (corroborated with similar meaning). However, some of his *ahadith* are *fard* (single) - for example, two *hadith* which al-Kulayni himself includes from al-Zuhri in *al-Kafi* as well.<sup>92</sup>

### **Conclusion**

It is undisputed that Ibn Shihab al-Zuhri travelled between the Hijaz and Syria and was in close contact with the Umayyads. Because of this, many Shi'a biographers have been deeply suspicious of accepting al-Zuhri's narrations. Nevertheless, al-Zuhri's narrations are included in prominent Shi'a works, including those of Shaykh Tusi, who himself criticized al-Zuhri. Three pieces of evidence are commonly cited to show that al-Zuhri held animosity towards Ahl al-Bayt - a letter attributed to Imam al-Sajjad, a statement by the historian Ya'qubi, and a statement by Ibn Abi al-Hadid. However, the circumstances surrounding each case suggest that these allegations against al-Zuhri are not historically accurate. Because of al-Zuhri's professed love for Imam al-Sajjad (A) and admiration for Imam 'Ali (A) and Fatimah al-Zahra (A), it is instead more likely that he did maintain a strong relationship with Imam al-Sajjad and his successors, and was more akin to Shi'a such as 'Ali ibn Yaqtin who worked with the court of the caliph but nonetheless were on the side of the Imam. Thus, despite the dispute over al-Zuhri, he should be accepted as a reliable *hadith* transmitter within the Shi'a school of thought.

*Table of key transliterated terms*

Term Appearing in Text	Arabic	Term With Diacritics
<i>Ibn Shihab al-Zuhri</i>	ابن شهاب الزهري	<i>Ibn Shihab al-Zuhri</i>
<i>Rijal</i>	رجال	<i>Rijal</i>
<i>Aduw</i>	عدو	' <i>Aduw</i>
<i>Muhaddith</i>	محدث	<i>Muhaddith</i>
<i>Jarh wa ta'dil</i>	جرح و تعديل	<i>Jarh wa Tadil</i>
<i>Mutabi'</i>	متابع	<i>Mutabi'</i>
<i>Shahid</i>	شاهد	<i>Shahid</i>
<i>Tabi'i</i>	تابعي	<i>Tabi'i</i>

*Notes*

1 I would like to thank Amina Inloes for her extensive assistance in preparing this article for publication.

2 Narrations from al-Zuhri can be found in the following Shi'a books: *al-Kafi* (14 narrations), *Tahdhib al-Ahkam* (8 narrations), *al-Istibsar* (4 narrations), *Man La Yahduruhu al-Faqih* (3 narrations), *Amali al-Saduq* (3 narrations), *al-Tawhid al-Saduq* (3 narrations), *al-Khisal* (9 narrations), *Halal-Shara'i'* (7 narrations), *Bihar al-Anwar* (50 narrations), and *Wasa'il al-Shi'ah* (58 narrations).

3 Ibn Hajar al-'Asqalani, *Tahdhib al-Tahdhib* IX (Beirut: Dar al-Fikr li-al-Tiba'ah wa al-Nashr wa al-Tawdi', 1984), 396.

4 Scholars who have mentioned him include Shaykh Tusi (d. 460 ah) in his *Rijal*, Ibn Dawud (d. 707 ah) in his *Rijal*, 'Allamah Hilli (d. 726 ah) in *Khulasat al-Aqwal*, Tafrishi (d. after 1044 ah) in *Naqd al-Rijal*, Muhammad Taqi Majlisi (d. 1070 ah) in *Lawam V Sahibqarani*, Muhammad Baqir Majlisi (d. 1110 ah) in *Maladh al-Akhyar* and *Mir'at al-Uqul*, Muhammad Baqir Bihbahani (d. 1205 ah) in *Ta'aliq Manhaj al-Maqal*, Ha'iri Mazandarani (d. 1306 ah) in *Muntaha al-Maqal ft Ahwal al-Rijal*, Mirza Husayn Nuri (d. 1320 ah) in *Khatimat Mustadrak al-Wasa'il*, al-Khu'i (d. 1413 ah) in *Mujam Rijal al-Hadith*, and Tustari (d. 1416 ah) in *Qamus al-Rijal*.

5 Shaykh Tusi's *Tahdhib al-Ahkam* and *al-Istibsar* are two of the four most influential Shi'a *hadith* books known as the 'Four Books'.

6 His full name is said to have been Muhammad ibn Muslim ibn 'Ubayd Allah ibn 'Abd Allah Asghar ibn Shihab ibn 'Abd Allah ibn Harith ibn Zuhrah al-Madani al-Qurayshi. Muhammad ibn Sa'd Waqidi, *al-Tabaqat al-Kubra* VI, trans. M. Damghani (Tehran: Farhang va Andishih, 1995), 137.

7 Ibid., 24.

8 Abu al-Qasim al-Khu'i, *Mujam Rijal al-Hadith* XVIII (Qum: n.p., 1990), 271; Mustafa Tafrishi, *Naqd al-Rijal* IV (Qum: Mu'assasat Al al-Bayt li-lhya' al-Turath, 1997), 324; also

see Abu 'Ali Ha'iri Mazandarani, *Muntaha al-Maqal fi Ahwal al-Rijal* VI (Qum: Mu'assasat Al al-Bayt li-lhya' al-Turath, 1995), 202; Mirza Husayn Nuri, *Khatimat Mustadrak al-Wasa'il* IX (Qum: Mu'assasat Al al-Bayt li-lhya' al-Turath), 97.

9 Abu al-Fida' Isma'il ibn 'Umar ibn Kathir, *al-Bidayah wa al-Nihayah* IX (Beirut: Dar al-Fikr, 1987), 341. Also see Abu al-Faraj ibn al-Jawzi, *al-Muntazam f Tarikh al-Umam* VII, ed. Muhammad 'Abd al Qadir Ata and Mustafa 'Abd al Qadir Ata, 1<sup>st</sup> ed. (Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyyah), 231.

10 Muhammad ibn Sa'd Waqidi, *al-Tabaqat al-Kubra* VI, 24.

11 Taqi al-Din Abu Muhammad al-Hasan ibn 'Ali ibn Dawud Hilli, *Rijal ibn Dawud* (Tehran: Tehran Danishgah, 2004), 336; also see Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Hiban, *al-Thuqat* V (n.p.: Mu'assasat al-Kutub al-Thaqafiyah, 1978), 349.

12 Muhammad ibn Sa'd Waqidi, *al-Tabaqat al-Kubra* VI, 24.

13 Ibid, 137.

14 al-Hasan ibn Yusuf ibn al-Mutahhar al-Hilli, *Khulasat al-Aqwal f Ma'rifat al-Rijal* (Qum: Dar al-Dhaka'ir, 1990), 250. Also see Abu al-Qasim al-Khu'i, *Mujam Rijal al-Hadith* XVII, 191; Mustafa Tafrishi, *Naqd al-Rijal* IV, 230; Abu 'Ali Ha'iri Mazandarani, *Muntaha al-Maqal f Ahwal al-Rijal* VI, 79.

15 Mustafa Tafrishi, *Naqd al-Rijal* IV, 230. Also see Mirza Husayn Nuri, *Khatimat Mustadrak al-Wasa'il* IX, 97; Abu al-Qasim al-Khu'i, *Mujam Rijal al-Hadith* XVII, 191.

16 Rafi' al-Din Ishaq ibn Muhammad Hamadani, *Sirat-i Rasul Allah*, ed. Asghar Mahdavi (Tehran: Kharazmi Publications, 3<sup>rd</sup> ed, 1998), 10.

17 Muhammad Mustafa Azami, *Studies in Early Hadith Literature* (Indianapolis: American Trust Publications, 1978), 284-5, citing Ibn Sa'd.

18 Rafi' al-Din Ishaq ibn Muhammad Hamadani, *Sirat-i Rasul Allah*, 10-11.

19 Ibid.

20 He has quoted *maghazi* from 'Urwah ibn al-Zubayr and Sa'id ibn al-Musayyib.

21 Joseph Horowitz, *al-Maghazi al-Ula wa Mu'allifuha*, trans. H. Nassar (Cairo: n.p., 1946), 67.

22 Badr al-Din Zarkashi, *al-Burhan fi 'Ulum al-Qur'an* II, ed. Mustafa 'Abd al-Qadir 'Ata, (Beirut: Dar al-Fikr, 1984), 153, also see Muhammad 'Ali Mahdavi Rad, *Sayr-i Nigarish-ha-yi Qur'ani* (Tehran: Holy Quran Exhibition, 2001), 20.

23 His teachers included Aban ibn 'Uthman ibn 'Affan, Salim ibn 'Abd Allah ibn 'Umar, 'Ubayd Allah ibn 'Utbah ibn Mas'ud, Nafi' (the freed slave of Ibn 'Umar), Muhammad ibn al-Nu'man ibn Bashir, 'Umar ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz, 'Ali ibn al-Husayn ibn 'Ali ibn Abi Talib, Sinan ibn Abi Sinan, and Malik ibn Anas. His students included Sufyan ibn 'Uyanah, his brother 'Abd Allah ibn Muslim ibn Shihab al-Zuhri, 'Ata ibn Abi Rabah, who is also one of the teachers of Ibn Shihab, Ibn Rashid, 'Abd al-Rahman ibn Ishaq al-Madani, and 'Abd al-Rahman ibn 'Umar. See Ahmad ibn 'Abd Allah Khazraji, *Tahdhib al-Kamalf Asma'al-Rijal*, ed. A. Mizzi (Beirut: Dar al-Fikr Publications, 1994), 223-25.

24 Husayn 'Azizi et al., *al-Ruwwat al-Mushtarak bayn al-Shi'ah wa al-Sunnah* (Tehran: World Forum for Proximity of Islamic Schools, 2009), 369-70.

25 Muhammad 'Abd al-Latif 'Abd al-Shafi, *al-Sirah al-Nabawiyyah wa al-Tarikh al-Islami* (Cairo: Dar al-Salam, 2007), 26.

26 Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Hiban, *al-Thuqat* V, 349; also see Mustafa Tafrishi, *Naqd al-Rijal* IV, 324; Abu al-Qasim al-Khu'i, *Mujam Rijal al-Hadith* XVIII, 271.

27 Muhammad ibn Muhammad ibn Hasan Tusi, *Rijal al-Tusi* (Najaf: Haydariyyah,

- 1992) , <sup>119</sup>.
- 28 al-Hasan ibn Yusuf ibn al-Mutahhar al-Hilli, *Khulasat al-Aqwal f Ma'rifat al-Rijal*, 250.
- 29 Mustafa Taffrishi, *Naqd al-Rijal* IV, 230.
- 30 Abu 'Ali Ha'iri Mazandarani, *Muntaha al-Maqalft Ahwalal-Rijal* VI, 79
- 31 Taqi al-Din Abu Muhammad al-Hasan ibn 'Ali ibn Dawud Hilli, *Rijal ibn Dawud* (Tehran: Danishgah-i Tihiran, 2004), 336.
- 32 Muhammad Baqir Majlisi, *Malaadh al-Akhyar* VII, ed. Sayyid Mahdi Raj'i (Qum: Ayatullah Mar'ashi Najafi Library, 1986), 106. He also mentions this in *Mir'at al-Uqul*.
- 33 Ahmad ibn 'Ali Najashi, *Rijalal-Najashi* (Qum: Jami'ah Mudarissin, 1987), 3.
- 34 Vahid Bihbahani, *Ta'aliq Manhaj al-Maqal* (Isfahan: Ahl al-Bayt Research and Publication Institute, n.d.), 313, 329.
- 35 Mirza Husayn Nuri, *Khatimat Mustadrak al-Wasa'il* IV, 300
- 36 Vahid Behbahani, *Ta'aliq Manhaj al-Maqal*, 313, 329.
- 37 Mirza Husayn Nuri, *Khatimat Mustadrak al-Wasa'il* IV, 300.
- 38 Muhammad Baqir Khansari, *Rawdat al-Jannat* VIII (Tehran: Kitabfurushi Islamiyyah, n.d.), 68.
- 39 It is related that when al-Zuhri was a governor for the Umayyads, he inadvertently killed a man while punishing him. After this, al-Zuhri is said to have spent nine years wandering the desert and living in a cave out of fear of divine retribution. He went to the Ka'bah to seek forgiveness and, there, met Imam al-Sajjad, who advised him on how to repent for his sin. Al-Zuhri is then said to have returned to his people and to have become one of the Imam's companions, to the point that some of Marwan's people would scoff at him and ask, 'How is your new prophet?', meaning 'Ali ibn al-Husayn (A). Muhammad Baqir Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar* XLV (Tihiran: Islamiyah Publications, n.d.), 132.
- 40 Abu al-Qasim al-Khu'i, *Mujam Rijalal-Hadith* XVIII, 271.
- 41 Muhammad Taqi Tustari, *Qamus al-Rijal* IX (Qum: al-Nashr al-Islamiyah Publications, 1998), 583.
- 42 Muhammad Taqi Majlisi, *Lawami '-i Sahib Qarani* VI (Qum: Ismailiyan Institute, 1993) , 171.
- 43 Ibid.
- 44 The letter is related in Muhammad Baqir Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar* LXXXV, 131-5 and Ibn Shu'bah al-Harrani, *Tuhaf al-Uqul*, ed. A. Ghaffari (Qum: Mu'assasat al-Nashr al-Islami li-Jama'at al-Mudarrisin, 1404 ah), 274-278. It has been analysed by Muhammad Hasan Zahidi Tuchayi, in 'Pizhuhishi darbarih-yi Namih Mansub bih Imam Sajjad (A)', in *Maqalat va Barrisiha* XXXX, no. 2 (2007), 85-95.
- 45 Since Imam al-Sajjad is said to have passed away around 95 AH, al-Zuhri would have been at the most 37 or 45 years old (depending on whether 50 or 58 AH is taken as the date of his birth, with 58 AH being the most likely) at the time of receiving the letter. Muhammad Hasan Zahidi Tuchayi, 'Pizhuhishi darbarih-yi Namih Mansub bih Imam Sajjad (A)'.
- 46 Ibid., 422-423.
- 47 Shams al-Din Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn 'Uthman al-Dhahabi, *Tarikh al-Islam wa Wafyat al-Mashahir wa al-A'lam* (Beirut: Dar al-Kitab al-'Arabi, 1990), 523; Yusuf ibn 'Abd al-Rahman al-Mizzi, *Tahdhib al-Kamal f Asma' al-Rijal* XVII, 226; Abu al-Faraj ibn al-Jawzi, *al-Muntadham f Tarikh al-Umam* IV, 697; Muhammad ibn Mukarram ibn 'Ali ibn Ahmad ibn Manzur, *Mukhtasar Tarikh Madinat Dimashq li-Ibn Asakir* XXIII (Damascus:

Dar al-Fikr, 1988), 227-30

48 Ibid.

49 Muhammad Baqir Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar* XLVI, 76.

50 Ibid, 64.

51 Ibid, 90.

52 However, some traditions give a different view and maintain that Ibn Shihab referred to Imam Sajjad (A) was scant in his narrations (*qalil al-hadith*). For an analysis of this, see Rida Masrur and Ghulamrida Raisian, 'Naqd va Barrasi-yi Rivayat Qalil al-Hadith Budan-i Imam Sajjad (A)', in *Kitab-i-Qayyim* I, no. 1 (Spring 2011), 175-195.

Answering to these remarks it can be said that the oldest source that refers to Imam Sajjad (A) as *qalil al-hadith* is narrated from al-Baghandi from Muhammad ibn Yahya from Sufyan from Ibn Shihab in *Tarikh Asma' al-Thuqat*; see 'Umar ibn Ahmad ibn Shahin, *Tarikh Asma' al-Thuqat* I (Tunis: al-Salafiyah, 1984), 140.

Biographical works indicate that al-Baghandi was accused of being a liar and of erring frequently; for instance, see Ahmad ibn 'Ali ibn Hajar al-'Asqalani, *Lisan al-Mizan* II (Beirut: al-'Alami li al-Matbu'at, 1986), 471. It is possible that the phrase *qalil al-hadith* was interpolated by al-Baghandi. Rida Masrur and Ghulamrida Raisian, 'Naqd va Barrasi-yi Rivayat Qalil al-Hadith Budan-i Imam Sajjad (A)', 190

In addition, the text itself is inconsistent and confused. For examples, the oldest sources relate that Ibn Shihab said, 'I have never seen a Hashimi more meritorious than 'Ali ibn al-Husayn, but he was *qalil al-hadith*.' 'Umar ibn Ahmad ibn Shahin, *Tarikh Asma' al-Thuqat* I, 140. Another narration reads, 'I sat with 'Ali ibn al-Husayn many times. I have never seen a person more knowledgeable than him in jurisprudence, but he was *qalil al-hadith*.' Abu Yusuf Ya'qub ibn Sufyan al-Fasawi, *al-Ma'rifah wa al-Tarikh* I, 132.

In contrast, 'I have never seen a Hashimi more meritorious than 'Ali ibn al-Husayn' has been related without the phrase 'but he was *qalil al-hadith*.' 'Ali ibn Isa Irbili, *Kashf al-Ghummah* II, 80.

53 Some authors maintain that if al-Zuhri truly had respected Imam Sajjad (A), he would have followed Imam Sajjad's son (Imam Baqir) after him. For instance, see 'Ali Rida Haydari, 'Ibn Shihab-i Zuhri va 'Adavat-i Ahl-i Bayt (A)', in *Pazuhish-ha-yi Qur'an va Hadith* XLIV, no. 2 (2012), 95. In response, it can be said that Imam Sajjad had recommended that 'Ubayd Allah do so, not al-Zuhri. However, it is related by al-Zuhri that the worst Arab tribes were Bani Umayyah, Bani Hanifah, and Bani Thaqif. Murtada Husayni Fayruzabadi, *Fada'il al-Khamsah* III (Tehran: Islamiyyah, 1972), 308.

54 Ahmad ibn Abi Ya'qub, Ya'qubi, *Tarikh Ya'qubi* II, trans. M. Ayati (Tehran: 'Ilmi va Farhangi, 1992), 204-5.

55 Abu Yusuf Ya'qub ibn Sufyan al-Fasawi, *al-Ma'rifah wa al-Tarikh* II, ed. A. al-'Umari (Beirut: al-Risalah, 1981), 294-5.

56 Abu Bakr Ahmad ibn Muhammad ibn Ishaq al-Hamadhani, *al-Buldan*, ed. Yusuf al-Hadi (Beirut: 'Alam al-Kutub, 1995), 146.

57 Abu Sa'id Wa'iz Khargushi, *Sharaf al-Nabi*, ed. M. Rawshan (Tehran: Babak, 1982), 421.

58 Yaqt ibn 'Abd Allah al-Rumi al-Hamawi, *Mujam al-Buldan* V (Beirut: Dar al-Sadr, 1995), 166.

59 Izz al-Din ibn al-Athir al-Jazari, *Usd al-Ghabah fi Ma'rifat al-Sahabah* I, ed. A. al-Rifa'i (Beirut: Dar Ihya al-Turath al-'Arabi, 1997), 350, 538.

60 Taqi al-Din Ahmad ibn Ali al-Maqrizi, *Imta al-Asma* XIV, ed. M. al-Namsy (Beirut:

Dar al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 2000), 621.

61 Abu al-Fida Isma'il ibn 'Umar ibn Kathir, *al-Bidayah wa al-Nihayah* III, 220.

62 Muhammad ibn Yusuf Salih, *Subul al-Huda wa al-Rashad fi Sirat Khayr al-Ibad* XII, ed. A. al-Mujud and A. Muawaz (Beirut: Dar al Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1994), 352.

63 'Izz al-Din ibn al-Athir al-Jazari, *Usd al-ghabah fi Ma'rifat al-Sahabah* I, 350; Taqi al-Din Ahmad ibn 'Ali al-Maqrizi, *Imta al-Asma* XIV, 621; Abu al-Fida Isma'il ibn 'Umar ibn Kathir, *al-Bidayah wa al-Nihayah* III, 220; Abu Bakr Ahmad ibn Muhammad ibn Ishaq al-Hamadani, *al-Buldan*, 146; Muhammad ibn Yusuf Salih, *Subul al-Huda wa al-Rashad fi Sirat Khayr al-Ibad* XII, 352; Abu Sa'id Wa'iz Khargushi, *Sharaf al-Nabi*, 421; Yaqut ibn 'Abd Allah al-Rumi al-Hamawi, *Mujam al-Buldan* V, 166; Abu Yusuf Ya'qub ibn Sufyan al-Fasawi, *al-Ma'rifah wa al-Tarikh* II, 294-5.

64 Ahmad ibn Abi Ya'qub Ya'qubi, *Tarikh Ya'qubi* II, 235.

65 In particular, the year 68 AH is the year when four flags were raised for the hajj - one for Ibn Hanifah, one for Ibn Zubayr, one for Bani Umayyah, and one for the Khawarij. 'Izz al-Din ibn al-Athir al-Jazari, *Usdal-Ghabah fi Ma'rifat al-Sahabah* XII, 183; also see Abu Ja'far Muhammad ibn Jarir Tabari, *Tarikh al-Rusul wa al-Muluk* VIII, trans. A. Payandih (Tehran: Asatir, 1996), 3443.

66 'Izz al-Din ibn Abi al-Hadid, *Sharh Nahj al-Balaghah* IV, ed. M. Ibrahim (Qum: Maktabat Ayatollah Mar'ashi Najafi, 1998), 10; Muhammad Baqir Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar* XLVI, 143.

67 Husayn 'Azizi et al., *al-Ruwat al-Mushtarak bayn al-Shi'ah wa al-Sunnah*, 371.

68 'Izz al-Din ibn al-Athir al-Jazari, *Usd al-Ghabah fi Ma'rifat al-Sahabah* I, 450.

69 Murtada Husayni Fayruzabadi, *Fada'il al-Khamsah* III, 77.

70 Ibid, 310.

71 Murtada Husayni Fayruzabadi, *Fada'il al-Khamsah* II, 115.

72 Fadl ibn al-Hasan Tabarsi, *Majma' al-Bayan fi Tafsir al-Qur'an* II, trans. R. Sutudih (Tehran: Farahani Publications, 1981), 203.

73 '[R]egarding the fast when travelling or suffering from an ailment, there is a great deal of difference of opinion in its regard. Some people say that he should fast, whereas others say that he should not. As far as we (Ahl al-Bayt (A)) are concerned, we are of the view that one should break his fast during both cases; so, if he fasts during his trip, or when sick, he has to make it up because Allah, the most Exalted, the most Great, says, "And if one of you is sick or travelling, (the fast of) a number of other days (suffices)...."' Muhammad ibn Ya'qub Kulayni, *al-Kaf* IV (Tehran: Dar al-Kutub al-Islamiyyah, 1987), 86-7.

74 Muhammad Baqir Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar* XXVI, 280-1.

75 Ahmad al-Rahmani Hamadani, *Imam 'Ali ibn Abi Talib*, trans. H. Vali (Tehran: Munir Farhangi, 1998), 545.

76 For instance, it is related that al-Zuhri said that none of the killers of Husayn (A) survived unless they suffered in this world, and, in a short time, they were killed or blinded, their faces were blackened, and they lost their political power; and that after the night of the martyrdom of Imam Husayn, whenever any stone was lifted in Syria, blood was found beneath it. Murtada Husayni Fayruzabadi, *Fada'il al-Khamsah* III, 301 and 296.

77 For instance Ibn Shihab al-Zuhri has narrated that 'Ali ibn Husayn narrated to him that Miswar ibn Makhramah reported that the Messenger of Allah (S) said: 'Fatimah is a part of me.' Ahmad ibn Shu'ayb al-Nasa'i, *Khasa'is 'Ali ibn Abi Talib* (Qum: Bustan-i Kitab, 2003), 142.

78 Al-Zuhri is quoted saying, "Ali ibn al-Husayn (A) asked me once, "Where did you come from, O Zuhri?" I said, "From the mosque." "What were you discussing?" he asked me. "We discussed the fast," I said, "and we all agreed that the only obligatory fast is the fast of the month of Ramadan." He said to me, "O Zuhri! It is not as you all say. Fasting is of forty different types: ten are as obligatory as the fast of the month of Ramadan; ten are prohibited; fourteen are optional - one may fast during them or he may not; add to that the three different kinds of conditional fasts. Add also the disciplinary fast (*ta'dib*), the permissible fast (*ibahah*), and the fast to make up missed fasts due to illness or travel." Abu Ja'far Muhammad ibn Hasan Tusi, *Tahdhib al-Ahkam* IV (Tehran: Dar al-Kutub al-Islamiyyah, 1946), 294.

79 Ibid., 294-297.

80 It is related from al-Zuhri that 'Ali ibn al-Husayn said, 'If those who are between the east and the west were to die, I would not feel lonely, for the Qur'an is with me.' Muhammad Baqir Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar* XLVI, 107.

81 It is related from al-Zuhri that 'Ali ibn al-Husayn (A), was asked about the best deeds in the view of Allah, and he answered, 'After recognizing Allah and His Messenger, the best deed in Allah's eyes is detesting the world. This has many branches. Disobedience has also many branches. Self-admiration was the first act of disobedience. It made Satan refuse [to prostrate himself to Adam], show haughtiness, and be an unbeliever. Envy was the sin of Adam's son. It made him kill his brother. From this branched love for women, the world, leadership, ease, words, superiority, and wealth. These have become seven qualities and come together in love of the world. After recognizing these qualities, the prophets and the scholars have said, 'Love of the world is the root of every sin, and the world is an abode of tribulation.' Muhammad ibn Ya'qub Kulayni, *al-Kafi* II, 131.

82 It is related that al-Zuhri said that 'Ali ibn al-Husayn (A) said, 'I have seen all good come together in cutting off craving for what is in the hands of men. When someone beseeches not men for a thing, and entrusts all his affairs to Allah, Allah will respond to him in all things.' Ibid., 138.

83 It is related that al-Zuhri said, 'Ali ibn al-Husayn (A) was asked about tribal love, which was among the manners of those who lived before Islam, and he replied, 'The prejudice which is a sin is when one regards the wicked from among his people as better than the good of other people. It is not an act of prejudice that one loves his people, but it is an act of prejudice is that one helps his people do wrong.' Ibid., 308-9.

84 al-Zuhri said, 'I heard 'Ali ibn al-Husayn (A) saying: "The verses of the Qur'an are treasuries. So whenever you open a treasury, it is befitting for you to look at what is in it."' Ibid., 609.

85 It is related that al-Zuhri said, 'Once, some people from the tribe of Quraysh approached 'Ali ibn al-Husayn (A) and asked him, "How do we invite [others] towards the religion [of Islam]?" He replied, "You must say, "*Bismillah al-Rahman al-Rahim*. I invite you towards Allah, the Mighty and the Glorious, and towards His religion, which comprises of two things. One of them is cognizance of Allah, the Mighty and the Glorious, while the other is performance of deeds in accordance with His pleasure.'" Muhammad ibn Ya'qub Kulayni, *al-Kafi* V, 36; Abu Ja'far Muhammad ibn Hasan Tusi, *Tahdhib al-Ahkam* VI, 141.

86 It is related that al-Zuhri said, 'I heard 'Ali ibn al-Husayn (A) saying: "One night's fever is atonement for a year [of sin]. Therefore, the effects of weakness remains in the body for a year.'" al-Hurr al-'Amili, *Wasa'il al-Shi'ah* II (Qum: Ahl al-Bayt Institute,



1988), 401.

87 It is related that al-Zuhri said that 'Ali ibn al-Husayn (A) said, 'If you capture a prisoner of war who cannot walk and there is no way to remove him from the battle, you have no right to kill him, because when a prisoner becomes Muslim he will be saved.' al-Hurr al-'Amili, *Wasa'il al-Shi'ah* XV, 72.

88 It is related that al-Zuhri said that 'Ali ibn al-Husayn (A) said, 'The most difficult times for the son of Adam are three times: the time when he meets the angel of death, the time when he rises from the grave, and the time when he is in the presence of God, and either goes to heaven or hell.' Muhammad ibn Babawayh al-Qummi, *al-Khisal* I (Qum: Jami'at al-Mudarrisin, 1983), 119.

89 The two *hadith* are:

(1) al-Zuhri relates from 'Ali ibn al-Husayn, 'As regarding the prohibited fast, it is forbidden to fast on 'Id al-Fitr, the day of 'Id al-Adha, [and] three of the days of *al-tashriq*. The days of *al-tashriq* are the days of Mina, which are the eleventh, twelfth, and thirteenth after the day of al-Nahr.'

(2) Zurarah relates that he asked Imam Muhammad Baqir, 'What shall we do with a person who has killed someone, by mistake, in the forbidden month?' The Imam said, 'Be strict with him regarding the blood money, and it is also obligatory on him to liberate a slave and fast for two months in repentance.' Zurarah said, 'Even if something is preventing him from fasting for two months?' The Imam said, 'What would that be?' Zurarah said, 'Such as 'Id or *ayyam al-tashriq*.' The Imam said, 'He has to fast even in those days as part of his compulsory fasting.'

Shaykh Tusi resolves the conflict between the following two *hadiths* by saying, 'The second *hadith* does not contradict the first *hadith* because fasting on 'Id al-Fitr, 'Id al-Adha, [or] three of the days of *al-tashriq* is forbidden for the person who starts to fast from these days on, but for the person who is obligated to fast for two months in a row it is necessary to fast during these days too.' Both the *hadith* as well as the reconciliation are found in Muhammad ibn Hasan Tusi, *al-Istibsar* II (Tehran: Dar al-Kutub al-Islamiyyah, 970), 131.

90 Abu Ja'far Muhammad ibn Hasan Tusi, *Tahdhib al-Ahkam* I, 183-4

91 Muhammad ibn Ya'qub Kulayni, *al-Kafi* IV, 81.

92 Al-Kulayni writes, 'And with this chain from al-Munqari from 'Abd al-Razzaq from Mu'ammarr from al-Zuhri from 'Ali ibn al-Husayn (A), who said, 'I saw the whole of goodness gathered in the severing of covetousness from what is in the hands of the people and from not having any hope in people regarding anything and in reverting his affair to Allah, Mighty and Majestic be He, in all affairs. Allah, Mighty and Majestic be He, will answer him for everything.' He also includes this *shahid hadith* in the same chapter including 'Ali ibn Ibrahim from his father and 'Ali ibn Muhammad al-Qashani together, from al-Qasim ibn Muhammad from Sulayman ibn Dawud from Hafis ibn Ghiyath, who said that Abu 'Abd Allah (A) said, 'When anyone amongst you desires that he ask his Lord for a thing and He grant it, then he should despair of people, all of them, and there should be no hope for him save near Allah. So when Allah, Mighty and Majestic be He, knows of this in his heart, he will not ask of Allah a thing save that He will grant it.' Both citations are in Muhammad ibn Ya'qub al-Kulayni, *al-Kafi* II, 148.