WCPCG-2010

System values development of students in school: attention to female students' value system in interaction with educational managers' role (Narrative Monograph of a High-School)

Behrooz Mahram\textsuperscript{a} *, Sedigheh Kazemi\textsuperscript{b}

\textsuperscript{a}Faculty member of Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, P.O Box:9177948991-1518, Mashhad, Iran
\textsuperscript{b}Curriculum Ph.D. student of Ferdowsi University of Mashhad. P.O Box:9177948991-1518, Mashhad, Iran

Received January 15, 2010; revised February 3, 2010; accepted March 25, 2010

Abstract

In this study we reviewed the formation of student values system in the face of educational management functions. Data were collected during a three–month period in one of Mashhad's high schools by narrative interviews. In order to increase the validity of the results, various methods such as triangulation, participant’s revision, re-coding and quasi-statistical analyses were used. The results indicate that school management to take the behavioral approaches for Value education that is insufficient. Consequently, the outcome of such managerial system would not be more than a rational, economic-centered human being.

© 2010 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

Keywords: Value system, narrative inquiry, graves' value theory, leadership.

1. Introduction

Hidden curriculum in a learning environment refers to the emotional atmosphere and non-written conditions that has the highest effect on values and emotions of the learning audience (for example Ausbrooks; 2000 and Skelton, 1997). Hidden curriculum includes all the processes and interactions that impact on the learning audience (Vallance, 1991). In this regard, hidden curriculum has high importance for influencing on spiritual and mental health of students and to achieve educational ideals. Beran (2006) has pointed to train of managers in the form of hidden curriculum that manager or set of the school’s management can to control students bullying behaviors through their role in the form of hidden curriculum.

In order to study the role of principal leadership in development of student’s value system, Graves's theory was selected as the fundamental theory in this study.
On the basis of this theory, any level provides a different texture for looking at the world and creates a different content for interpreting the world. When the individual expands the texture, the content is also expanded in such a way that he/she understands the topics that he has not already realized and have been outside his capacity of mind. The value systems are the systems that control the behavior and motivate decision taking. Although Graves primarily used English letters for specifying the levels of his value system, but Beck and Cowen (1996), his students, coded them in eight colors for more comprehensibility and facilitating in understanding better the value systems which bear no special indicator or code. Table 1 shows the eight levels of Graves’ Value System on the basis of the classification of colors.

According to Rosado (2004), the research done by Graves indicated that the areas pertaining to the value system is similar to the sections or fragments of a symphony which starts from the simplest mode and becomes more and more complicated. As the individuals are moving in this helical course step by step and from one level to the next one, their world and thought become more complicated. In this process called as elevation by Ken Wilber, the higher levels include the previous ones and the higher level values are made from the previous levels accompanied with the new values and modern methods of looking at the world. This is the same as the nuclear of the atom which is encircled in another atom in a higher level and the atom is embedded in a molecule and a molecule in a cell. The cell also in its growing process is placed within an organism. The implication of this theory in the education is that the instructional system can pay attention to the growth and development of these systems. In this respect, the individual’s level should also be considered. Such an outlook is an obstacle for focusing in a special type of value system in human being and the education which direct humans towards a form or level functions similar to a carwash where the impacts of its horizontal brush stroke to the individuals in the same way.

In an investigation done on research studies, it was found that Leonard (1999) has studied the interactions between teachers and managers for investigating the obstacles for cooperation in value development. In the present
research paper which is done on one multi-cultural schools in Canada through a qualitative approach, the researcher, benefiting from the shared observation, semi-structured interview, and studying the documents available in the school, realized that the values played a significant role in the interschool cooperation and suggested it as an important factor in promoting the staff. In the present study, the school principals are considered as the individuals who have pivotal roles in establishing and developing cooperation culture through extending the shared values and obligations.

MacBeath (retold from Dempster and Lizzio, 2007) in a research for preparing the ground, asked the high school students to express their expectations from their principal. The contents of the most data collected from the students were providing more opportunity for leadership and participation in leading the school. The students pinpointed that there is no other leadership opportunity for the other staff of the school except the instructional manager. According to the students’ viewpoints, the responsibilities and duties of the leader should be developed among the other staff of the school, parents and more among the students. In fact, most of the students have referred to allowing more students’ participation in leading the school without any consideration to their ages.

Niu and Wang (2009) in an experimental study on the sample group including 265 Taiwanese principals investigated the efficiency of the leaders with fatherly leadership (benevolently). They focused on three dimensions of fatherly leadership including despotism, benevolence, and morality as the independent variables. After intervention and manipulation of these variables, they found that benevolence and morality in fatherly manner increases the work motivation among the staff and their obedience from their supervisor; but there was no relationship between despotism (power concentration) and increase of motivation or obedience, while moral and benevolent interaction of the leaders, requires more optimal outputs of the staff and have more efficiency in comparison with the other styles of leadership.

In 2006, Duffy and Sedlocek also studied a sample group including 3484 sophomore students in one of the great universities of the U.S.A. through surveying with the objective to respond to the question “What value system approach can help the development and growth of the students?” They reported that the open value system can be followed by more investment of the students in social issues and higher open-mindedness in groups and more optimal attitudes in comparison with different cultures. Eisa and Hanoreh (retold from Khalifeh, 1999) during their comparative studies about the values of two groups of the youth from Kuwait and Egypt also reported that the system of values of any society is different from the other one and the youth’s values and their changes are resulted from their interaction and the effect of the social factors and educational and promotional institutions on them. In a qualitative research done about the leadership and participation of the girls in leadership based on the Survey Theory, Hoyt and Kennedy (2008) realized that by introducing the female leaders to the girls, they conceptualize leadership concept in a more expansive spectrum and consider mutual respect as the factors which cause the development of conceptualization. Mahram (2005) in a study done about the evaluation of the hidden curriculum in higher education system of Iran, compared the process of transformation of students in three time levels of the first semester, the fourth semester and the last semester and reported that the religious identity, national identity, scientific identity, and bearing responsibility has been reduced among the students and cheating, addiction, and impudence towards the opposite sex have increased. In this study, the role of components such as curriculum in these changes has been investigated through the Eisner Evaluation Model Based on Expertise and Criticism. In a research done by Monshi (2005) entitled “the Susceptibility of the Students’ Value System in the Family and School”, 894 student and 420 parents of the same students were studied. According to this study, there is a positive relation between micro-systems and the parents’ value system with the students’ value system. While no relation was found between the value systems of the teachers and school staff. In another study done by Shamsian (1992) entitled “The Study of the Hierarchy of the Female and Male Adolescents in Tehran”, 225 high school students with high, intermediate, and low economical-social classes were selected and they were asked to fill out the Alport Value Questionnaire. On the basis of the findings of that study, no significant difference was found in value hierarchy among the girls from different classes.

Research Method

Considering the new interest of the scientific centers in studying the social textures through qualitative and phenomenological studies, the approach of this research is qualitative and inspired by interpretational theory and case study with narrative inquiry. Also, with regard to the study done about a certain school through investigating
all the factors and experiences related to the subject and studying the behavior, sayings and behavior of the individuals engaged in the organization especially, the students, principal, assistants, and teachers, the narrative inquiry was used. As Pinnegar and Daynes(2006) suggest:

"Narrative can be both a method and the Phenomenon of Study. As a method, it begins with the experiences as expressed in lived and told stories of individuals." (As cited in Creswell, 2007, 54)

In that study, narrative inquiry was one of the management roles for the principals as a procedure for investigating the experiences of the students in value dimension related to the components of supervision and control. According to Connelly and Clandinin (2000, 128), narrative research is an effective method for retrieval and understanding the phenomenon that has been obtained from experiences. The case study is a girls’ high school in Mashhad, Iran and the period of the research is the academic year 2008-09. The sources of data collection include the shared observations and irregular observation of the interpersonal interactions and semi-organized interview with the principle and the assistants of the school, teachers, parents and the students as well as the literature. In collecting the students’ narratives, 13 under-study high school students were selected through a procedure to achieve a goal and on the basis of the possibility of more participation in research process. They narrated their experiences in 17 sessions. Various methods were used for making the data reliable and being in line with Johnson’s viewpoint (retold from Ming, 2005) who considered three criteria including descriptive validity, interpretive validity, and theoretical validity important for narrative studies. In tandem with this, the three-directional method of voice recording for increasing the accuracy in rereading and implementation of data, daily note-taking from all the observed events, and taking photos and films from the documents and scripts were employed for collecting data.

The member checking procedure was used for interpretative validity that refers to the researcher’s understanding of the participants’ attitudes and experiences. According to this procedure, the matters inferred from sayings and narrations of the individuals were retold for them. In the case that they were not in conformity with the individual’s purpose, they were corrected and revised. The general narration was presented to several students and their attitudes about the generalities of the narration were asked. Also, for increasing the theoretical validity which refers to selecting the theory appropriate to the subject that is, in fact, equipping the researcher with theoretical lenses, it has been tried to make a careful research about the theories associated with the formation and transformation of value system, the approaches to hidden curriculum, and the theories related to the functions and the roles played by the principals.

According to Creswell (2007) and Maxwell (2005), the analysis process has been done in coincidence with the stages of data collection. Creswell (the same reference) considers a helical and flexible model for data analysis better than a linear and constant approach. On the basis of this proposed pattern, the following stages have been followed:

1) Writing all the matters resulted from observation, semi-organized interview and narrative inquiry,
2) Rewriting the notes, 3) Editing the rewritten matters, 4) Coding the data on the basis of data source, the tools used for collecting data and Graves’ eight-level value system, 5) Entry to the table of data registration, 6) Retrieval of information, 7) Analysis of the contents of data on the basis of their content and frequency, 8) Conclusion & 9) Writing the final report.

For coding data and because of using triangulation method in collecting data, the figures 1-6 were allocated to the narrations and observations done by the researcher, students, principal and assistants, teachers, other school staff, and parents respectively.

It should be noted that kind of coding is in conformity with the techniques of coding the data of the qualitative researches done by Tehmina (2003, 145-152). Tehmina believes that in qualitative researches, coding is the result of the researchers’ attempt and the software classify the data in line with the coding by the researcher.

**Findings & Conclusion**

According to the observations done and on the basis of the collected narrations, the managerial system of the under-study school pay more attention to the students’ cognitive development and their point averages and other yields such as developing their affection and motor aspects have been neglected. Although William Ouchi (retold from Moshabbaki and Rouhani(2006, 167) has referred to bureaucratic and group non-formal control and consider the formal, inflexible, hierarchical, limited in participation, vertical organizational structure, and external control as
the characteristics of the bureaucratic control, the date resulted from observations, interviews, and narrations indicate that the applied supervision and control is nearer to the bureaucratic control. Because the principal and assistants frequently resorted in their sayings to the legal control and to the circular and by-laws received from their organization; this kind of control was rarely applied to the students. From among the cases observed about this matter, we may refer to the lecture delivered by the principal in high school aiming at making the students familiar with the rules and regulations that should be respected during examinations. After speaking about the date, starting and termination times of the examinations and the necessity to observe all the rules and regulations of the school during the examinations as well as avoiding any cheating which is a kind of theft and deserves punishment, the principal said:

“A half score (0.5) will be deducted from the discipline score of the students who were absent without any excuse during the week before holidays”[student]

Any of the thirteen participating students have narrations with the same content and with various characters and in different times and places about the controls (with inspection aspect) applied by the principal and assistants. They considered these controls as the cause for establishing special methods by the students to conceal their cell phones and other unauthorized devices as well as to make pretensions for playing a trick on the principal and assistants.

“….in the classroom, I and my classmates read a magazine during the break, the page containing the photo of one of the male actors was open, suddenly, our principal called me: Somayyeh, why do you bring such things to the school” I was shocked. They come suddenly to us so that they intervene in our affairs…”[student].

“when I see the assistants, I feel frightened instead of security and tranquility; because they intervene in our affairs uselessly. They enjoy the useless rules of the school and frequently say: Mademoiselle, cover your hair with your scarf; Oh, you have manicured your nails! Three scores is deduced from your discipline, etc…”[student]

“….When the assistants came to the class to search our bags for mobile phones, I concealed it in my veil inside my desk…”[student].

The controls were applied before, during, and after committing the action. But these controls were superficial and could not establish a durable change in the learner’s internal layers of affections. The assistants are supposed to stick participants’ numbers on chairs already set for examination inside the classrooms and corridors and put a wide scotch tape on numbers so that the students can not conceal their notes for cheating. Even for preventing the students from committing cheating through writing on posters and cardboards stuck on the walls of the classroom[for displaying the practical work of the students], the assistants removed them from the walls and put them in trash bins. After planning and preparing the place for holding examinations, there was a need for several individuals to watch carefully so that the students could not cheat in the exams. Mahram(2005) states that in a usual classroom, if several students intend to cheat in the examination, in spite of the watchmen in the session, finally, some commit this action. If it is assumed that ten students cheat in an examination and one or two of them are identified by the watchmen, how they are behaved? Is giving zero, informing their parents, and sending their records to the Educational Council, …lead to correction of the their behavior and developing truthfulness and honesty in them? Or, on the contrary, do their scandal and obstinacy become incarnated and bring a reversed result which is opposed to the educational objectives? He added (in the same reference):

“Now, we may have a look at this matter from another aspect. If the operator of the examination reminds the participants that they are gifted human dignity and because of the trust we can have in human position, we have avoided appointing watchmen for the session, how many of the ten cheater in the previous example will cheat in the exam? How many of them feel that they are winners and this feeling is reinforced? And how many are challenged with the call of their conscience?”

The management staff of the school considers an exemplary student one who firstly does his/her best in studying courses and the scores he/she obtain reflect their efforts, secondly, observe the rules and regulations of the school unquestionably. They encourage and reinforce such a student verbally and financially.
“The student who does his/her best is one who attempts more than the others and respect the disciplinary rules not the one whose score is the top. The student who does not observe the rules is punished and the one who respect the rules is encouraged”[assistant].

The student who thinks of trying hard in studying to achieve higher ranks, is the successful and exemplary student and should be encouraged, he/she is dispatched to the recreational camps and is awarded commendation plates, etc...[assistant].

The principal tried to apply her supervision on all the affairs. The materials written for advertising were chosen by the educational assistant at first, then, they were submitted to the principal for final approval. All the presents and awards were purchased under his direct supervision. The gift for the Teacher Day, even, the type of flower donated by the student to the teachers was determined by the principal. This hierarchical and vertical outlook in supervision and control prevent from the intervention of the students and teachers or other staff in coining rules and regulations the result of which was that they deem no obligation for themselves to observe them(narrated by a student). In a book exhibition held on the occasion of the Teacher Week in a part of the corridor of the high school..., the sexual ethics has been placed under other books in such a way that does not attract anyone’s attention (narrated by a student). According to what has been stated and with regard to the data collected from various sources, the students were established in the levels 2-4 of the Graves’s value system on the basis of the supervision and control performance of the managerial staff of the school and the school system has been unable to leading the learners to Holism, integration, community-oriented and thinking-orientation. The table 2 illustrates the distribution of the data collected from various sources.

Table (2) - Distribution of collected data from different sources in Graves's value system levels

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Levels</th>
<th>first</th>
<th>second</th>
<th>Third</th>
<th>Fourth</th>
<th>Fifth</th>
<th>Sixth</th>
<th>Seven</th>
<th>Eight</th>
<th>sum</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manager &amp; assistants</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observation</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sum</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

References


